
IRISH IMMIGRANT EXPERIENCES AT THE
GALLAGHER RESIDENTIAL SITE (20CX201),
BEAVER ISLAND, CHARLEVOIX COUNTY,
MICHIGAN: RESULTS OF THE 2010
ARCHAEOLOGICAL FIELD SCHOOL

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME ACCESSION #2010.01

Prepared for:

Dr. John Halsey
Office of the State Archaeologist
702 West Kalamazoo Street
Lansing MI 48915

Prepared by:

Deborah L. Rotman, Ph.D., RPA
Department of Anthropology
University of Notre Dame
622 Flanner Hall
Notre Dame IN 46556
(574) 631-2308
drotman@nd.edu

with contributions by

Catherine Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas

2 June 2011

PRELIMINARY DRAFT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	1
Acknowledgements	2
Chapter 1: PROJECT INTRODUCTION	3
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Chapter 2: BRIEF HISTORY OF IRISH IMMIGRATION AND THE PROJECT AREA	6
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Brief Summary of Beaver Island History	7
Research Questions of Interest	19
Chapter 3: METHODS AND DATA	21
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Chapter 4: SOCIAL RELATIONS AND CULTURAL LANDSCAPES	23
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Studying Cultural Landscapes in the Midwestern United States	23
Landscape Archaeology	24
Framework for the Investigation of the Irish Diaspora in the Midwest	25
Urban Farmsteads and Changes to the Landscape	25
Social Relations of Class	27
Social Relations of Gender	27
Social Relations of Ethnicity	39
The Irish Diaspora in America	40
Unique Contributions of this Project	41
Chapter 5: RESEARCH VISIT TO CO. DONEGAL, NORTHERN IRELAND, AND DUBLIN	44
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman and Rhiannon Duke</i>	
Chapter 6: WEEK-LONG CULTURAL STUDY, CONNEMARA, IRELAND	61
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas</i>	
Irish Language: Prof. Dónal Ó Droghneáin, Carna Center, Co. Galway	61
An Gorta Mór: Dan O’Hara History and Heritage Center, Clifden, Co. Galway	61
The Landscapes of Connemara: Cartographer Tim Robinson, Roundstone, Co. Galway	64
Daily Life and Material Culture (part I): Hennigan’s Heritage Center, Killasser, Swinford, Co. Mayo	64
Daily Life and Material Culture (part II): National Museum of Country Life, Turlough, Co. Mayo	64
Religious History of Connemara: Prof. Irene Whelan, Clifden, Co. Galway	66
Landscape Hikes with Michael Gibbons	67
Sean-nós Singing/Dancing at the Carna Hotel	68
Daily Life and Material Culture (part III): Ionad Oidhreachta Leitir Meallláin and Gharumna Heritage Center	68
Visit to Fínis with Seán Ó Guairim	69
Interface of Irish Emigration and Folk Tradition: Dr. Pádraig Ó Healaí, Carna Center, Co. Galway	69
Political History: Teach an Phairsaigh, Rosmuc, Co. Galway	70

TABLE OF CONTENTS, continued

Irish Emigration to America: Máirtín Breathnach, Carna Center, Co. Galway	71
Chapter 7: ORAL HISTORY AND NARRATIVES OF MIGRATION	72
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Engagement and archaeological practice	72
Oral history as a critical data set	72
Elucidating the Irish-American Experience through Engagement	74
Summary and Conclusions	78
Oral Histories Collected on Beaver Island	78
<i>By Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas</i>	
Bill McDonough	79
Robert Cole	88
Helen Pike	99
Johnny Runberg	107
Chapter 8: ARCHAEOLOGICAL EXCAVATION ON BEAVER ISLAND	117
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas</i>	
Unit Summaries	120
Chapter 9: PUBLIC EDUCATION AND OUTREACH	184
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Chapter 10: HISTORIC MATERIALS RECOVERED	185
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Architecture Group	186
Arms and Munitions Group	187
Clothing Group	187
Communication and Education Group	187
Domestic Group	188
Faunal/Floral Group	203
Furnishings Group	203
Maintenance and Subsistence Group	204
Personal Group	205
Indeterminate Group	207
Chapter 11: SPECIALTY ANALYSES AND PRELIMINARY INTERPRETATIONS	208
<i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i>	
Chronology	208
Changes to the Landscape over Time	214
Incorporation, Alienation, and Transnationalism	215
Glass Medicine Bottles	216
Comparative Data with South Bend	216
Refined Earthenwares	223
Comparative Data with South Bend	225

TABLE OF CONTENTS, continued

Chapter 12: SENIOR THESIS PROJECTS	231
Essay 1: Interethnic Marriage in the Irish-American Experience: Social Transformation on Beaver Island, Michigan <i>by Rhiannon Duke and Deborah L. Rotman</i>	231
Essay 2: The Effects of Immigration on Irish Islander Place-Based Identity <i>by Bianca Fernandez and Deborah L. Rotman</i>	243
Essay 3: Spatial Dimensions of Social Relations: Gendered Domestic Spaces on Árainn Mhór, Co. Donegal and Beaver Island, Michigan <i>by Jacqueline Thomas and Deborah L. Rotman</i>	258
References Cited	271

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1. Location of Árainn Mhór off the coast of Co. Donegal, Ireland.	4
Figure 1.2. Location of Beaver Island off the mainland of Michigan.	5
Figure 6.1. Gable view of the Dan O’Hara homestead.	62
Figure 6.2. Chickens outside the coop of the Dan O’Hara homestead.	62
Figure 6.3. Michael Gibbons speaking to the students about cultural landscapes near D’Arcy Castle outside Clifden.	67
Figure 6.4. Crannóg in Connemara.	68
Figure 6.5. The view of gloomy Fínis from the currach.	69
Figure 7.1. Bill McDonough in his office above McDonough’s Market on Beaver Island.	79
Figure 7.2. Robert Cole in the Holy Cross Parish.	88
Figure 7.3. Map to accompany Robert Coles’ interview transcription.	89
Figure 7.4. Helen Pike in her home on Beaver Island.	100
Figure 7.5. Johnny Runberg in his home on Beaver Island.	108
Figure 8.1. Location of the Gallagher Homestead (20CX201) on Beaver Island.	118
Figure 8.2. Field conditions on the first day of excavation.	119
Figure 8.3. A hand-sketched map showing locations of excavation units	119
Figure 8.4. South wall profile at the base of level 14, Unit 1.	124
Figure 8.5. A hand-sketched profile of the south wall of Unit 1.	125
Figure 8.6. A hand-sketched profile of the south walls of Units 2 and 4.	131
Figure 8.7. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 3.	135
Figure 8.8. Plan view, base of excavation level 10 in Unit 4.	138
Figure 8.9. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 5.	145
Figure 8.10. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 6.	148
Figure 8.11. West wall profile of Unit 7.	151
Figure 8.12. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 7.	151
Figure 8.13. Debris on the ground in the area of the trash dump at the beginning of excavation of Unit 8.	153
Figure 8.14. The team excavating Unit 8.	154
Figure 8.15. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 8.	157
Figure 8.16. Volunteer Cindy Pikaart and Notre Dame student Kasia Ahern excavating Unit 9.	158

LIST OF FIGURES, continued

Figure 8.17. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 9.	162
Figure 8.18. Beaver Island schoolteacher Adam Richards at work in the root cellar.	163
Figure 8.19. Volunteer Jim Rotman and Principal Investigator Dr. Deb Rotman documenting their excavation progress in Unit 11.	169
Figure 8.20. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 11.	172
Figure 8.21. A hand-sketched profile of the south walls of Units 8 and 12.	176
Figure 8.22. Base of excavation, level 7, Unit 13.	179
Figure 8.23. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 13.	180
Figure 8.24. A hand-sketched profile of the west wall of Unit 14.	183
Figure 10.1. Buttons recovered from the Gallagher Homesite.	188
Figure 10.2. Suspender clasp recovered during the excavation of Unit 8, Level 6.	188
Figure 10.3. Example of blue transfer printed whiteware.	190
Figure 10.4. Examples of whiteware plate with embossed patterning.	190
Figure 10.5. Fragments of a teacup with polychrome floral decal and embossed decorations.	191
Figure 10.6. Fragment of an ironstone soup plate with an embossed design.	193
Figure 10.7. Fragments of a semi-porcelain plate with simple green border design.	193
Figure 10.8. Fragments of salt-glazed stoneware.	195
Figure 10.9. Blown-in-mold fruit jar fragment with ground lip.	196
Figure 10.10. Blown-in-mold medicine bottle with hand finish.	197
Figure 10.11. Pepsi-Cola bottle, 1960-1969.	197
Figure 10.12. Amber medicine bottle, 1903 to present.	198
Figure 10.13. Key opener for tin can recovered from Unit 8, Level 1.	199
Figure 10.14. “Presto” fruit jar lid/closure, 1925-1946	201
Figure 10.15. Amethyst press-molded glass candy dish, 1880-1914.	202
Figure 10.16. Fork recovered during the excavation of Unit 8, Level 1.	203
Figure 10.17. Eyeglass lens recovered from Unit 1, Level 7.	205
Figure 10.18. Safety razor, double-edged, not adjustable, 1875-1960.	206
Figure 10.19. Loop earring with faux gem inset decoration.	206
Figure 10.20. Religious medallions.	206
Figure 10.21. Samples of dog tags recovered from Unit 8.	207
Figure 11.1. Histogram of window glass dates from the Gallagher Site.	215
Figure 11.2. 1873 plat map of the Sorinsville neighborhood, South Bend, Indiana.	218
Figure 11.3. 1949 Sanborn Fire Insurance map showing the Fogarty parcel.	219
Figure 11.4. Copper lustre plates recovered from the feature.	227
Figure 11.5. Polychrome decal teacup with embossed rim from the feature.	227
Figure 12.1. Monument on Árainn Mhór commemorating the Twinning Ceremony.	248
Figure 12.2. Ordnance Survey Map of Árainn Mhór.	250
Figure 12.3. Partial map of Beaver Island.	251
Figure 12.4. Two-room cottage on Árainn Mhór with a window for each room.	263

LIST OF FIGURES, continued

Figure 12.5. Irish-built Greene Homestead on Beaver Island.	266
Figure 12.6. Typical Mormon log house.	267
Figure 12.7. Photograph of Greene Family Homestead on Árainn Mhór.	268
Figure 12.8. Sketch of the Greene Homestead floor plan on Beaver Island.	268

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1. Census Summary ~ 1850; entire island, largely Mormon occupation.	9
Table 2.2. Census Summary ~ 1860; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation.	10
Table 2.3. Census Summary ~ 1870; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation.	12
Table 2.4. Census Summary ~ 1880; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation.	12
Table 2.5. Census Summary ~ 1900; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation.	14
Table 2.6. Census Summary ~ 1910; entire island, multicultural society.	15
Table 2.7. Census Summary ~ 1920; entire island, multicultural society.	16
Table 2.8. Census Summary ~ 1930; entire island, multicultural society.	17
Table 2.9. Summary by percentage of male occupations, 1860-1930.	19
Table 10.1. Historic Artifacts Recovered from the Gallagher Homestead Site.	185
Table 11.1. Summary of dates for units and levels excavated at the Gallagher Site.	209
Table 11.2. Summary of minimum glass vessels recovered from the Gallagher Site.	216
Table 11.3. Summary of medicinal bottles recovered from the Fogarty Site.	220
Table 11.4. Summary of minimum ceramic vessels recovered from the Gallagher Site.	223
Table 11.5. Vessel and decoration summary of ceramic tea and table wares by occupation at the Fogarty Site.	226
Table 11.6. Summary of vessel forms by occupation, Fogarty Site.	228
Table 12.1. Raw Beaver Island Population.	237
Table 12.2. Beaver Island Irish Households	237
Table 12.3. Married Beaver Island Irish and non-Irish	238
Table 12.4. Unmarried Beaver Island Irish and non-Irish	239
Table 12.5. Beaver Island Married Couples involving Irish-born immigrants	240
Table 12.6. Marriages between an Irish-born individual and an individual with non-Irish parents	240
Table 12.7. Changing marriage patterns on Beaver Island	241
Table 12.8. Interethnic Marriage of both Irish-born and Second-generation Irish households	242
Table 12.9. Summary of measurements of houses on Árainn Mhór	261

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Artifact Inventory	304
--------------------------------	-----

