
IRISH IMMIGRANT EXPERIENCES AT THE
GALLAGHER RESIDENTIAL SITE (20CX201),
BEAVER ISLAND, CHARLEVOIX COUNTY,
MICHIGAN: RESULTS OF THE 2010 and 2011
ARCHAEOLOGICAL FIELD SCHOOLS
Volume I

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME ACCESSION #2010.01

Prepared for:

Dr. Dean Anderson
Office of the State Archaeologist
702 West Kalamazoo Street
Lansing MI 48915

Prepared by:

Deb Rotman, Ph.D., RPA, Principal Investigator
Ann Kroll Lerner, Ph.D.
Heather Van Wormer, Ph.D.
Ariel Terpstra, B.A.
Department of Anthropology
University of Notre Dame
622 Flanner Hall
Notre Dame IN 46556
(574) 631-7125
drotman@nd.edu

with contributions by

Catherine Ahern, Kaitlyn Davis, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, Laura Fernandez, Adam Lake,
Maria Rodriguez, Danielle Rush, Abby Statham, and Jackie Thomas

21 March 2013

PRELIMINARY DRAFT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| Abstract | 1 |
| Acknowledgements | 2 |
| Chapter 1: PROJECT INTRODUCTION | 3 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Chapter 2: BRIEF HISTORY OF IRISH IMMIGRATION AND THE PROJECT AREA | 6 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Brief Summary of Beaver Island History | 7 |
| Research Questions of Interest | 19 |
| Chapter 3: METHODS AND DATA | 21 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Chapter 4: SOCIAL RELATIONS AND CULTURAL LANDSCAPES | 23 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Studying Cultural Landscapes in the Midwestern United States | 23 |
| Landscape Archaeology | 24 |
| Framework for the Investigation of the Irish Diaspora in the Midwest | 25 |
| Urban Farmsteads and Changes to the Landscape | 25 |
| Social Relations of Class | 27 |
| Social Relations of Gender | 27 |
| Social Relations of Ethnicity | 39 |
| The Irish Diaspora in America | 40 |
| Unique Contributions of this Project | 41 |
| Chapter 5: RESEARCH VISIT TO CO. DONEGAL, NORTHERN IRELAND, AND DUBLIN | 44 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman and Rhiannon Duke</i> | |
| Chapter 6: WEEK-LONG CULTURAL STUDY, CONNEMARA, IRELAND | 61 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas</i> | |
| Irish Language: Prof. Dónal Ó Droghneáin, Carna Center, Co. Galway | 61 |
| An Gorta Mór: Dan O’Hara History and Heritage Center, Clifden, Co. Galway | 61 |
| The Landscapes of Connemara: Cartographer Tim Robinson, Roundstone, Co. Galway | 64 |
| Daily Life and Material Culture (part I): Hennigan’s Heritage Center, Killasser, Swinford, Co. Mayo | 64 |
| Daily Life and Material Culture (part II): National Museum of Country Life, Turlough, Co. Mayo | 64 |
| Religious History of Connemara: Prof. Irene Whelan, Clifden, Co. Galway | 66 |
| Landscape Hikes with Michael Gibbons | 67 |
| Sean-nós Singing/Dancing at the Carna Hotel | 68 |
| Daily Life and Material Culture (part III): Ionad Oidhreachta Leitir Meallláin and Gharumna Heritage Center | 68 |
| Visit to Fínis with Seán Ó Guairim | 69 |
| Interface of Irish Emigration and Folk Tradition: Dr. Pádraig Ó Healaí, Carna Center, Co. Galway | 69 |
| Political History: Teach an Phairsaigh, Rosmuc, Co. Galway | 70 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS, continued

| | |
|---|------------|
| Irish Emigration to America: Máirtín Breathnach, Carna Center, Co. Galway | 71 |
| Chapter 7: ORAL HISTORY AND NARRATIVES OF MIGRATION | 72 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Engagement and archaeological practice | 72 |
| Oral history as a critical data set | 72 |
| Elucidating the Irish-American Experience through Engagement | 74 |
| Summary and Conclusions | 78 |
| Oral Histories Collected on Beaver Island | 78 |
| <i>By Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, and Jackie Thomas</i> | |
| Bill McDonough | 79 |
| Robert Cole | 88 |
| Helen Pike | 99 |
| Johnny Runberg | 106 |
| Fr. Dan Connaghan | 115 |
| Alvin LaFreniere and Johnny Runberg | 129 |
| Joyce Bartels | 149 |
| Rod Nackerman | 180 |
| Roland Cull | 175 |
| Janet O'Donnell and Rosemary [Nackerman] Smith | 184 |
| Lawrence McDonough and Pam [McDonough] Grasmick | 227 |
| Jim and Lynne Flanagan | 243 |
| Chapter 8: ARCHAEOLOGICAL EXCAVATION ON BEAVER ISLAND | 267 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman, Kasia Ahern, Kaitlyn Davis, Rhiannon Duke, Bianca Fernandez, Laura Fernandez, Adam Lake, Maria Rodriguez, Danielle Rush, Abby Statham, and Jackie Thomas</i> | |
| Unit Summaries | 269 |
| Chapter 9: PUBLIC EDUCATION AND OUTREACH | 371 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Chapter 10: HISTORIC MATERIALS RECOVERED | 372 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Architecture Group | 373 |
| Arms and Munitions Group | 374 |
| Clothing Group | 374 |
| Communication and Education Group | 375 |
| Domestic Group | 375 |
| Faunal/Floral Group | 390 |
| Furnishings Group | 390 |
| Maintenance and Subsistence Group | 391 |
| Personal Group | 392 |
| Indeterminate Group | 394 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS, continued

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 11: SPECIALTY ANALYSES AND PRELIMINARY INTERPRETATIONS | 395 |
| <i>by Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Chronology | 395 |
| Changes to the Landscape over Time | 404 |
| Incorporation, Alienation, and Transnationalism | 406 |
| Glass Medicine Bottles | 407 |
| Comparative Data with South Bend | 408 |
| Refined Earthenwares | 414 |
| Comparative Data with South Bend | 417 |
| Re-examination after the Second Field Season | 422 |
| Chapter 12: SENIOR THESIS PROJECTS | 425 |
| Essay 1: Interethnic Marriage in the Irish-American Experience: Social Transformation on Beaver Island, Michigan | 425 |
| <i>by Rhiannon Duke and Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Essay 2: The Effects of Immigration on Irish Islander Place-Based Identity | 437 |
| <i>by Bianca Fernandez and Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| Essay 3: Spatial Dimensions of Social Relations: Gendered Domestic Spaces on Árainn Mhór, Co. Donegal and Beaver Island, Michigan | 451 |
| <i>by Jacqueline Thomas and Deborah L. Rotman</i> | |
| References Cited | 465 |
| Appendix A: Artifact Inventory 2010 | 501 |
| Appendix A: Artifact Inventory 2011 | 589 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | |
|--|-----|
| Figure 1.1. Location of Árainn Mhór off the coast of Co. Donegal, Ireland. | 4 |
| Figure 1.2. Location of Beaver Island off the mainland of Michigan. | 5 |
| Figure 6.1. Gable view of the Dan O’Hara homestead. | 62 |
| Figure 6.2. Chickens outside the coop of the Dan O’Hara homestead. | 62 |
| Figure 6.3. Michael Gibbons speaking to the students about cultural landscapes near D’Arcy Castle outside Clifden. | 67 |
| Figure 6.4. Crannóg in Connemara. | 68 |
| Figure 6.5. The view of gloomy Fínis from the currach. | 69 |
| Figure 7.1. Bill McDonough in his office above McDonough’s Market on Beaver Island. | 79 |
| Figure 7.2. Robert Cole in the Holy Cross Parish. | 88 |
| Figure 7.3. Map to accompany Robert Coles’ interview transcription. | 89 |
| Figure 7.4. Helen Pike in her home on Beaver Island. | 99 |
| Figure 7.5. Johnny Runberg in his home on Beaver Island. | 107 |
| Figure 7.6. Alvin LaFreniere and Johnny Runberg at the Print Shop Museum. | 130 |
| Figure 7.7. Joyce Bartels outside her home on Beaver Island. | 149 |
| Figure 7.8. Rod Nackerman in his home. | 161 |
| Figure 7.9. Roland Cull in his home on Beaver Island. | 175 |

TABLE OF FIGURES, continued

| | |
|---|-----|
| Figure 7.10. Joyce O'Donnell and Rosemary [Nackerma] Smith in Janet's home. | 184 |
| Figure 7.11. Pam Grasmick and Lawrence McDonough in Mr. McDonough's home. | 227 |
| Figure 7.12. Jim and Lynne Flanagan, Beaver Island, summer 2011. | 243 |
| Figure 8.1. Location of the Gallagher Homestead (20CX201) on Beaver Island. | 268 |
| Figure 8.2. Field conditions on the first day of excavation. | 268 |
| Figure 8.3. Map showing locations of excavation units | 269 |
| Figure 8.4. South wall profile at the base of level 14, Unit 1. | 273 |
| Figure 8.5. Profile of the south wall of Unit 1. | 275 |
| Figure 8.6. Profile of the south walls of Units 2 and 4. | 280 |
| Figure 8.7. Profile of the west wall of Unit 3. | 283 |
| Figure 8.8. Plan view, base of excavation level 10 in Unit 4. | 287 |
| Figure 8.9. Profile of the west wall of Unit 5. | 293 |
| Figure 8.10. Profile of the west wall of Unit 6. | 296 |
| Figure 8.11. West wall profile of Unit 7. | 298 |
| Figure 8.12. Profile of the west wall of Unit 7. | 299 |
| Figure 8.13. Debris on the ground in the area of the trash dump at the beginning of excavation of Unit 8. | 300 |
| Figure 8.14. The team excavating Unit 8. | 302 |
| Figure 8.15. Profile of the west wall of Unit 8. | 304 |
| Figure 8.16. Volunteer Cindy Pikaart and Notre Dame student Kasia Ahern excavating Unit 9. | 305 |
| Figure 8.17. Profile of the west wall of Unit 9. | 309 |
| Figure 8.18. Beaver Island schoolteacher Adam Richards at work in the root cellar. | 310 |
| Figure 8.19. Volunteer Jim Rotman and Principal Investigator Dr. Deb Rotman documenting their excavation progress in Unit 11. | 315 |
| Figure 8.20. Profile of the west wall of Unit 11. | 318 |
| Figure 8.21. Profile of the south walls of Units 8 and 12. | 322 |
| Figure 8.22. Base of excavation, level 7, Unit 13. | 325 |
| Figure 8.23. Profile of the west wall of Unit 13. | 326 |
| Figure 8.24. Profile of the west wall of Unit 14. | 329 |
| Figure 8.25. Profile of the south wall of Unit 15. | 333 |
| Figure 8.26. Profile of the west wall of Unit 15. | 334 |
| Figure 8.27. Profile of the west wall of Unit 16. | 337 |
| Figure 8.28. Profile of the south wall of Unit 16. | 337 |
| Figure 8.29. Profile of the south wall of Unit 17. | 340 |
| Figure 8.30. Profile of the east wall of Unit 17. | 340 |
| Figure 8.31. Profile of the west wall of Units 18 and 21. | 348 |
| Figure 8.32. Profile of the east wall of Units 18 and 21. | 349 |
| Figure 8.33. Profile of the south wall of Unit 19. | 351 |
| Figure 8.34. Profile of the east wall of Unit 20. | 354 |
| Figure 8.35. Profile of the south wall of Unit 20. | 354 |
| Figure 8.36. Profile of the south wall of Unit 22. | 357 |

TABLE OF FIGURES, continued

| | |
|---|-----|
| Figure 8.37. Profile of the east wall of Unit 22. | 357 |
| Figure 8.38. Profile of the south wall of Unit 23. | 360 |
| Figure 8.39. Profile of the south wall of Units 20 and 24. | 364 |
| Figure 8.40. Profile of the east wall of Units 15 and 24. | 364 |
| Figure 8.41. Profile of the south wall of Unit 26. | 367 |
| Figure 8.42. Profile of the south wall of Unit 27. | 370 |
| Figure 10.1. Buttons recovered from the Gallagher Homesite. | 375 |
| Figure 10.2. Suspender clasp recovered during the excavation of Unit 8, Level 6. | 375 |
| Figure 10.3. Example of blue transfer printed whiteware. | 377 |
| Figure 10.4. Examples of whiteware plate with embossed patterning. | 377 |
| Figure 10.5. Fragments of a teacup with polychrome floral decal and embossed decorations. | 378 |
| Figure 10.6. Fragment of an ironstone soup plate with an embossed design. | 380 |
| Figure 10.7. Fragments of a semi-porcelain plate with simple green border design. | 380 |
| Figure 10.8. Fragments of salt-glazed stoneware. | 382 |
| Figure 10.9. Blown-in-mold fruit jar fragment with ground lip. | 383 |
| Figure 10.10. Blown-in-mold medicine bottle with hand finish. | 384 |
| Figure 10.11. Pepsi-Cola bottle, 1960-1969. | 384 |
| Figure 10.12. Amber medicine bottle, 1903 to present. | 385 |
| Figure 10.13. Key opener for tin can recovered from Unit 8, Level 1. | 386 |
| Figure 10.14. “Presto” fruit jar lid/closure, 1925-1946 | 388 |
| Figure 10.15. Amethyst press-molded glass candy dish, 1880-1914. | 389 |
| Figure 10.16. Fork recovered during the excavation of Unit 8, Level 1. | 390 |
| Figure 10.17. Eyeglass lens recovered from Unit 1, Level 7. | 392 |
| Figure 10.18. Safety razor, double-edged, not adjustable, 1875-1960. | 393 |
| Figure 10.19. Loop earring with faux gem inset decoration. | 393 |
| Figure 10.20. Religious medallions. | 393 |
| Figure 10.21. Samples of dog tags recovered from Unit 8. | 394 |
| Figure 11.1. Histogram of window glass dates from the Gallagher Site. | 406 |
| Figure 11.2. 1873 plat map of the Sorinsville neighborhood, South Bend, Indiana. | 410 |
| Figure 11.3. 1949 Sanborn Fire Insurance map showing the Fogarty parcel. | 410 |
| Figure 11.4. Copper lustre plates recovered from the feature. | 419 |
| Figure 11.5. Polychrome decal teacup with embossed rim from the feature. | 420 |
| Figure 12.1. Monument on Árainn Mhór commemorating the Twinning Ceremony. | 442 |
| Figure 12.2. Ordnance Survey Map of Árainn Mhór. | 444 |
| Figure 12.3. Partial map of Beaver Island. | 445 |
| Figure 12.4. Two-room cottage on Árainn Mhór with a window for each room. | 456 |
| Figure 12.5. Irish-built Greene Homestead on Beaver Island. | 460 |
| Figure 12.6. Typical Mormon log house. | 461 |
| Figure 12.7. Photograph of Greene Family Homestead on Árainn Mhór. | 461 |
| Figure 12.8. Sketch of the Greene Homestead floor plan on Beaver Island. | 462 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table 2.1. Census Summary ~ 1850; entire island, largely Mormon occupation. | 9 |
| Table 2.2. Census Summary ~ 1860; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation. | 10 |
| Table 2.3. Census Summary ~ 1870; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation. | 12 |
| Table 2.4. Census Summary ~ 1880; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation. | 12 |
| Table 2.5. Census Summary ~ 1900; entire island, largely Irish immigrant occupation. | 14 |
| Table 2.6. Census Summary ~ 1910; entire island, multicultural society. | 15 |
| Table 2.7. Census Summary ~ 1920; entire island, multicultural society. | 16 |
| Table 2.8. Census Summary ~ 1930; entire island, multicultural society. | 17 |
| Table 2.9. Summary by percentage of male occupations, 1860-1930. | 19 |
| Table 10.1. Historic Artifacts Recovered from the Gallagher Homestead Site. | 372 |
| Table 11.1. Summary of dates for units and levels excavated at the Gallagher Site. | 396 |
| Table 11.2. Summary of minimum glass vessels recovered from the Gallagher Site. | 407 |
| Table 11.3. Summary of medicinal bottles recovered from the Fogarty Site. | 412 |
| Table 11.4. Summary of minimum ceramic vessels recovered from the Gallagher Site. | 414 |
| Table 11.5. Vessel and decoration summary of ceramic tea and table wares by occupation at the Fogarty Site. | 419 |
| Table 11.6. Summary of vessel forms by occupation, Fogarty Site. | 420 |
| Table 12.1. Raw Beaver Island Population. | 431 |
| Table 12.2. Beaver Island Irish Households | 431 |
| Table 12.3. Married Beaver Island Irish and non-Irish | 432 |
| Table 12.4. Unmarried Beaver Island Irish and non-Irish | 433 |
| Table 12.5. Beaver Island Married Couples involving Irish-born immigrants | 434 |
| Table 12.6. Marriages between an Irish-born individual and an individual with non-Irish parents | 434 |
| Table 12.7. Changing marriage patterns on Beaver Island | 435 |
| Table 12.8. Interethnic Marriage of both Irish-born and Second-generation Irish households | 436 |
| Table 12.9. Summary of measurements of houses on Árainn Mhór | 455 |