Ethnogenesis and Irish-American Identity on Beaver Island, Michigan
Revised Research Design

Prepared by
Dr. Deb Rotman, RPA
University of Notre Dame
5 December 2013

Statement of significance and impact

As immigrants from Árainn Mhór off the coast of County Donegal created new lives on Beaver Island in northern Michigan, their identities and social worlds were profoundly shaped by their interactions with a Mormon community that first settled on the island, Native Americans who lived elsewhere in the archipelago, and other ethnic groups with whom they interacted. This multi-year multi-institutional project in historical archaeology engages undergraduate students as active collaborators in all phases of the research and contributes significantly to the scholarly discourse on diaspora, ethnogenesis, and identity of Irish and other subaltern groups. Three years of excavation on the island have been completed thus far (2010-2012). This document seeks to update and revise the research design guiding those archaeological and historical investigations.

Early occupation of Beaver Island was an eclectic mix of Irish, German, Native American, and other families scattered on subsistence farms around its perimeter (pre-1847). The population was then dominated by a Mormon sect during the mid-century until their leader was assassinated in 1856 and they were forcibly removed by Irish immigrants reclaiming Beaver Island for themselves. During the second half of the 19th century, nearly 95% of the families on the island were of Irish descent (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1860, 1870, 1880, 1900). The Beaver Island Lumber Company altered the cultural landscape by bringing an influx of foreign laborers in 1903 (Gladish 1976).

Rather than simply representing demographic shifts in the island’s population, the cultural exchanges that accompanied each of these transitions profoundly shaped Irish identity and ethnogenesis (the process of forming new cultural identities). Ethnic identities were defined and solidified through contact with other peoples. Instead of a straight line of one group becoming like another, however, interactions between these entities represented a series of negotiations in which some ethnic traditions continued, individual choices and adaptations made, and cultural norms rejected or subverted.

As Irish identities and lived experiences on Beaver Island were transformed through cultural interaction with non-Irish groups so too were their material and social worlds. By examining syncretic processes in material culture, dietary changes, and uses of the built environment, this interdisciplinary and collaborative project will investigate the ways in which Irish families continued traditions from their
homeland, incorporated new cultural norms and practices, and otherwise navigated the multifaceted and ever-changing social landscapes in which they lived.

Substance and context

This interdisciplinary project undertakes archaeological and historical investigations of a series of 19th-century homesteads associated with Irish immigrants on Beaver Island, Michigan. Transnational research, including the use of archival resources and collection of oral histories in both the United States and Ireland, is central to the project as is the incorporation of undergraduate students as active collaborators on all phases of this research endeavor. By examining changes in material culture, dietary preferences, and uses of the built environment, the team investigates the ways in which Irish families continued traditions from their homeland, incorporated new cultural norms and practices, and otherwise negotiated their ever-changing social worlds. The results of this work contribute significantly to the scholarly discourse on diaspora, ethnogenesis, and identity.

Between 1815 and the Civil War, five million people immigrated to the United States; 40% of these – nearly two million – were from Ireland (Bodnar 1996:2). Prior to 1845, experiences of Irish immigrants varied widely according to place of origin, family circumstances, and other factors. After 1845, however, the lives of Irish immigrants were united by the commonalities of: (1) the Great Famine and general agricultural decline in their homeland; (2) the changed power of Catholicism in America with the significant influx of Irish Catholics; (3) an emerging Irish nationalist ideology and communal identity; and (4) the concentration of immigrants into American urban and industrial landscapes (Doyle 2006:213).

At present, the lives of Irish immigrants in America are understood almost exclusively from investigations of large urban centers like Boston and New York (e.g., Adams 1967; Brighton 2009; Diner 1983; Donnelly 2001; Gallagher 1982; Kinealy 1995; McCaffrey 1976, 1997; Meagher 2001; Miller 1985; O’Connor 1995; O'Grady 1973; O'Toole 2000). Historical accounts of immigration tend to homogenize individual experiences; thus, the incredible variation of immigrant stories both in Ireland and the US is often veiled in anonymous tellings of emigration and resettlement. Stereotypes of Irish immigrants are frequently based upon expatriates in the densely occupied tenements of unskilled laborers in large cities on the East Coast, but life in these ethnic enclaves is not wholly representative of Irish experiences in America (Doyle 2006:219). Many Irish immigrants settled beyond the eastern seaboard of North America; however, their lives are much less well understood (exceptions include Emmons 1989 and Smith 2004). Smaller communities in the Midwest, for example, had economic, social, and political structures that were more fluid than those of the long-established urban enclaves (Esslinger 1975). As such, those who settled in less urban and less industrial places – such as Beaver Island, Michigan – were afforded, for better or worse, different opportunities than their counterparts in large cities (Doyle
Consequently, archaeological and historical investigations of these smaller and more isolated communities will contribute significantly to our understanding of the Irish diaspora in America by elucidating lived experiences in small towns and rural fishing villages not previously explored.

Emigrating Irish families encountered profound discrimination in America, particularly those arriving during the second half of the 19th century (Orser 2001:10). The sheer volume of immigrants fleeing *an Gorta Mór* (the Great Hunger) along with their frequent state of destitution resulted in poor public perception (Doyle 2006:216). Nativists feared that newly arrived immigrants would “outbreed, outvote, and overwhelm the ‘old’ native stock” (Bailey and Kennedy 1983:300).

There were divisions between Protestants and Catholics in the Midwest and elsewhere in the United States that were intimately linked to nativist/non-nativist rhetoric (Giffen 1996:248). The presence of the Roman Catholic Church in America was significantly changed by the tide of immigration in the 19th century. There were 1.1 million Catholics in United States in 1845 and 3.1 million in 1860 – about one half of which can be attributed to Irish immigrants during that time (Doyle 2006: 240). The numbers of congregants continued to grow to 6.3 million in 1880 (Doyle 2006:241).

Irish Catholics were further discriminated against as they were often associated with racially-marginalized African Americans (Mullins 2001:163). The Irish developed a monopoly on unskilled labor in construction work and factory employment, which put them in rather fierce competition with American Blacks (Wolf 1982:364). Being “white” for the Irish meant engaging in the dominant institutions of society, from which they had largely been excluded in colonized Ireland (Paynter 2001:136).

Beaver Island with its relatively remote location created unique opportunities for individuals and families seeking to build new lives in America (Connors 1995). The island was not “a blank slate,” however, as Irish immigrants interacted with a variety of other cultural groups throughout their history. Prior to 1847, occupation on the island was a varied mix of Irish, German, Native American, and other families who were scattered on subsistence farms around the island’s periphery (Metress and Metress 2006). Encounters with French fur traders, commercial fisherman, and crews of cargo ships transporting goods between Buffalo, New York and Chicago were also not uncommon (Collar 1980).

The social dynamics of the island were radically altered in 1847. After a dispute with Brigham Young over leadership of the Mormon Church, James Strang brought his followers to Beaver Island and established the Kingdom of St. James (Weeks 1976:10). There was considerable tension between Strang and non-Mormon families and, by 1856, the island was inhabited almost exclusively by Mormons. In June of that year, two of his disgruntled followers assassinated Strang, after which Irish immigrants evicted the Mormons and reclaimed Beaver Island for themselves (Weeks 1976:9).

Most of the Irish exiles returned, “establishing new fishing camps and farms and occupying former Mormon sites” (Metress and Metress 2006:33). Occupation of the island went from being almost
exclusively Mormon to almost exclusively Irish in less than a generation. Indeed during the second half of the 19th century, nearly 95% of the families on the island were of Irish descent (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1860, 1870, 1880, 1900). Perhaps not surprisingly, this is also the period during which chain migration direct from Árainn Mhór, County Donegal was most active. At the peak of Irish immigration, Beaver Island was a Gaeltacht, one of only a few Irish-speaking enclaves in the United States (Sullivan 2010:65). Homesteads occupied by Irish immigrants during this period will be excavated during the proposed project. (Greater detail about the sites to be investigated is provided on pages 11-12.)

The Beaver Island Lumber Company altered the cultural landscape of the island by bringing an influx of foreign laborers in 1903 (Gladish 1976). Although the Irish continued to have a strong presence, the logging camps were occupied by lumberjacks and millers from Germany, Denmark, Norway, France, Austria, England, and even India (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1910). The Gaeltacht faded into history as English became the language through which daily business was transacted.

It is these varied cultural contacts between circa 1840 and circa 1920 that are the foci of this project. Identity is contrastive by nature: ‘we’ exist by reference to a distinguishing ‘them’ (Newton 2010:96). How was Irish identity and ethnogenesis shaped by interaction with peoples of varied ethnicities? How was “Irishness” performed when the island was occupied by disparate cultural groups, such as Native Americans and Mormons? How was identity mediated in the second half of the 19th century when the island was so homogenously Irish? How were consumer choices, food ways, and uses of space shaped and transformed as Irish immigrants on Beaver Island navigated the multifaceted social worlds in which they lived?

Assimilation of cultural groups into new surroundings is a process (Kivisto 2004:155). Rather than a straight line of one group becoming like another, it is a series of complex negotiations in which some ethnic traditions may continue, individual choices and adaptations made (Greenwood and Slawson 2008:77), and cultural norms rejected or subverted (Joseph 2004:19). Murray (2006:6) describes this process as that of becoming or devenir; “Becoming never stops yet occasionally changes its direction, or ripples in turbulent flows, forever following its course towards a new identity.”

Issues of identity and culture contact are of key importance to other scholars interested in ethnogenesis and the experiences of other diasporic peoples. This proposed project investigating Irish America on Beaver Island, therefore, both draws from and contributes to these interdisciplinary discourses. Research at Fort Michilimackinac, for example, has focused on interactions between the areas indigenous people and the French and British soldiers and fur traders at the Fort. Scott’s (2001) investigation of the site, however, revealed that Fort Michilimackinac was a multicultural place occupied by German Jews, French Canadians, Native Americans, African Americans, and Métis. Each of these groups “used religion, language, dress, food, and house style to emphasize their cultural traditions” (Scott...
Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States

2001:32). In this context of colonialism, uses of the material world were both symbols of ethnic identity and overt displays intended to reinforce superior-inferior statuses among the colonizers and the colonized. Consequently, the process of ethnogenesis at the fort was not about acculturation, but rather the reassertion of traditional cultural norms in response to conflict among highly varied ethnic groups.

Franklin (2001) observed a similar phenomenon in colonial Virginia. Foodways were used as a vehicle for racial and cultural identity, to construct and maintain group boundaries. Although the Afro-Virginians in her study were enslaved on Tidewater plantations, they were able to use their resources and knowledge to produce foodways that both demonstrated some measure of autonomous cultural production within the context of slavery as well as their own within-group construct of identity.

An isolated marine community of Overseas Chinese along the central California coast was studied by Greenwood and Slawson (2008). Their analyses revealed both continuity and change in this immigrant enclave. Foodways and traditional dishes persisted in their use, while architectural changes to houses and associated furnishing were somewhat more malleable through time. Rather than simply “measuring assimilation according to percentages of imported vs. domestic manufactured items, [critical analyses of the material world of this village] illuminated broader issues such as evidence of continued ethnic traditions, resistance to American cultural norms, individual adaptations, and the persistence of a small but distinctive culture with its own values and behaviors” (Greenwood and Slawson 2008:77; see also Joseph 2004:19). Importantly, their study highlights the complex negotiations that constitute the process of becoming and the ways in which identity is selectively mediated through material culture, often with reference to both the world people currently inhabit and the worlds they left behind upon emigrating.

A transnational perspective is imperative for understanding continuity and change in Irish immigrant experiences. Significantly, “processes of dispersion were historically and socially distinctive for captive Africans, Irish migrants, and the Overseas Chinese, but scholarship on all these diasporas centers around the articulated, constructed, and unrecognized connections displaced peoples have with their origins” (Mullins 2008:155). In addition, “social networks consist of the local and Ireland” and that “it is important to understand that their Ireland (not the geographical but the one in their minds) has been relocated” to their new communities (Murray 2006:16). Much of this constructed identity on Beaver Island has not yet been informed by the archaeological record. This interdisciplinary and collaborative project investigates the process of becoming Irish-American on Beaver Island.

Data for these investigations

The scope of the research. This research builds on the success of a 2010-2012 pilot project. If funding can be secured to support additional work, this project will continue over three years (1 June 2013-31 May 2016), consisting of the following components each year: (1) a week-long cultural study in
Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States

Ireland, (2) three weeks of intensive field excavation on Beaver Island, (3) laboratory processing and preliminary analyses of artifacts recovered during the excavation, (4) archival research, (5) oral history collection, (6) continued specialty and other analyses as warranted by the research questions (specifically botanical, faunal, ceramic, glass, other artifacts, and uses of domestic space), and (7) public outreach, report writing, and dissemination of research results through web sites, public lectures, conference presentations, and peer-reviewed journal articles. Undergraduate students from the University of Notre Dame, Grand Valley State University, and the University of Vermont will be active collaborators in all phases of the project, but this opportunity will also be open to interested students from other institutions.

Source materials include a broad spectrum of evidentiary classes. The 2010-2012 pilot project utilized cultural study in Ireland, artifacts and architecture, oral history, and archival resources; each of which will also be used for the proposed project for 2013-2016.

Cultural study in Ireland. In partnership with an tAcadamh na hOllscolaíochta Gaeilge, National University of Ireland, County Galway, we will begin each field season with a week-long cultural study in Western Ireland (if sufficient funds are available to support this phase of the research endeavor). The primary learning goals are for students to develop an understanding of:

1) The richness of Irish culture – music, storytelling, language, religious practice, and tradition, with a particular emphasis on those aspects of Irish culture that emigrants would have brought with them to America. Through the cultural study, students begin to understand social practices, rituals, meanings, and how objects were used in their original contexts in Ireland. An immersion into Irish culture also greatly assists students in comprehending the human behaviors and social aspects of the artifacts that are recovered archaeologically. They begin to understand that artifacts really are “material culture.”

2) The historical contexts for emigration from Ireland as well as their consequences. Emigration was shaped by a variety of political, social, economic, religious, and other factors, which varied both through time and across space. One consequence of the colonial experience in Ireland is that Irish-American experiences tend to be homogenized. The stereotype of the impoverished slum-dwelling factory worker immigrant tends to dominate understandings of Irish experiences in the US, but the reality was much more varied, diverse, and dynamic. Students will become aware of temporal and regional variations as well develop a transnational perspective on Irish immigration.

The tentative itinerary for the cultural study is:

**Friday, June 21**  
Depart US

**Saturday, June 22**  
Arrive Dublin, travel to Carna

**Sunday, June 23**  
Morning: Lecture/primer on Irish language w/ Prof. Dónal Ó Droighneáin  
Afternoon: Visit Dan O’Hara Heritage Center w/ Prof. Máirtín Breathnach  
Evening: Independent Study (reading/writing/reflecting)
Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States

**Monday, June 24**  
Morning: Visit to Hennigan’s Heritage Center, Co. Mayo w/ Prof. Tom Hennigan  
Afternoon: Visit to National Museum of Country Life, Co. Mayo  
Evening: Return to Carna

**Tuesday, June 25**  
Morning: Lecture on Irish religious history w/ Dr. Irene Whelan  
Afternoon: Multi-temporal landscape hike and archaeological sites tour, part I w/ Prof. Michael Gibbons  
Evening: Lecture on Irish political history w/ scholar to be determined

**Wednesday, June 26**  
Morning/Afternoon: Multi-temporal landscape hike and archaeological sites tour, part II w/ Prof. Michael Gibbons  
Evening: Independent study

**Thursday, June 27**  
Morning: Folding Landscapes w/ Prof. Tim and Máiréad Robinson  
Afternoon: Traditional instrument shop, Roundstone w/lecture on Irish music  
Evening: Traditional céilí, including sean-nós singing

**Friday, June 28**  
Morning: Lecture on Irish Folklore w/ Dr. Pádraig Ó Healaí  
Afternoon: Maritime history, lecture and currach tour w/ Prof. Seán Ó Guairim  
Evening: Prepare for departure

**Saturday, June 29**  
Travel to Dublin, depart for US

Students will journal throughout the cultural study, documenting the contexts from which Irish immigrants came and the complexities of their experiences. This activity will inform both the individual projects students will undertake as part of their participation in this research endeavor and also contribute to larger research questions and project goals.

Previous excavations. To date, 204 archaeological sites have been identified in Charlevoix County, Michigan, including 44 sites on Beaver Island. Most of these were documented during surveys of the island by James Fitting (1973) and Joseph Chartkoff (1989, 1993). The University of Notre Dame conducted the first controlled excavations of an Irish-American homestead in 2010-2011 (Rotman et. al 2011, 2012). Excavation at the Gallagher Homesite (20CX201) revealed stratified middens, discrete features such as building foundations and trash pits, and extant architecture, including a mid-19th century log cabin, sheds, and other outbuildings. Historical and archaeological investigation at the Boyle Farm site (20CX204) was undertaken in 2012. Although there was no extant architecture, a cellar hole was visible and a rich midden was revealed archaeologically (Rotman et al. 2013). There has been very little development on the island, particularly outside of the village of St. James, and so preservation of archaeological deposits is excellent.

Artifacts and architecture. Each summer (July) will include three weeks of intensive archaeological excavation at a series of 19th - and early 20th-century homesteads on Beaver Island associated with Irish immigrants. Excavation will be preceded by remote sensing (electrical resistivity and gradiometry) in order to identify cultural deposits and discrete features, which will help guide the
placement of units and focus the excavation. Investigations will include both controlled excavation and mapping of the houses and surrounding landscapes. The spatial data collected through mapping will be coupled with the material data gathered through excavation, allowing for the identification of activity areas as well as assessment of how uses of space have changed over time.

The homesteads that serve as the foci of this project are: (1) The Peter Doney Gallagher homestead (20CX201), the site of the 2010-2011 pilot project, had a diverse occupation representing many cultural groups on the island. Built by Mormons in the 1840s, the cabin was occupied by a German family immediately following the Mormon eviction. Beginning in the 1880s, it was then occupied by multiple generations of two Irish families (the Earlys and the Gallaghers) up through the early 21st century. The occupational history of this homelot provides a wonderful cross-section of lived cultural experiences on the island (Rotman et al. 2011, 2012). (2) The Daniel and Catherine Boyle Farm Site (20CX204) on Barney’s Lake Road was occupied by this first generation Irish immigrant family from 1884 until 1895, when they built a new, bigger house across the street. Excavated in the summer of 2012, the Boyle Farm site is contemporary with the Gallagher Home Site and, thus, an exceptional comparative data set (Rotman et al. 2013). Although not part of the requested funding under this proposed project, the results of excavation at the Gallagher Homestead and the Boyle Farm site contribute important data for understanding ethnogenesis and Irish identity on the island.

(3) The Bonner Centennial Farm (20CX70) was occupied by multiple generations of the same Irish immigrant family from the 1850s through the early 20th century; whereas (4) the Gillespie Homestead (20CX116) was built by an Irish immigrant family at about the same time as the Bonner Farm, but was continuously occupied by different Irish families up through the early 21st century. As such, the occupational histories of these households provide data for Irish identity and ethnogenesis that spans the Mormon period, through the peak Irish occupation during the second half of the 19th century, and then through the transitional history of the island as it became increasingly culturally diverse with the arrival of the Beaver Island Lumber Company. Finally, (5) the Protar Homestead (20CX69) was built and occupied by an Irish immigrant family in 1857 during the immediate post-Mormon period. From 1892-1925, the house was home to Feodor Protar (Geman). Following his death, the house was occupied by a series of families from a variety of cultural backgrounds. The specific history of this house provides data for both Irish and non-Irish occupation of the island during the late 19th century as well as the transitional period on the island of increasing cultural diversity in the early decades of the 20th century.

The project also includes laboratory processing and preliminary analyses of the artifacts recovered during the field season. Artifacts from the 2010-2011 excavations of the Gallagher homestead and the 2012 investigation at the Boyle Farm site included container glass, fruit jars, refined and unrefined earthenwares, metal food containers, buttons, beads, coins, personal objects and religious
medallions, botanical remains including seeds and dried fruits, and butchered fauna (such as cow, pig, deer, and poultry). The laboratory module runs both concurrently with the field excavation (in the evenings) as well as occur during two full-time weeks at the end of the field season. We have improvised, but secure laboratory space at the Brothers’ Place on Beaver Island as well as dedicated space in the Reyniers Laboratory on the campus of the University of Notre Dame.

In addition to the spatial and temporal analyses mentioned above, this interdisciplinary and collaborative project will focus on the ways in which material culture and foodways were shaped as a result of cultural interaction and evolving Irish identity on the island. Changes in consumer items, such as refined earthenwares and container glass, as well as to botanical, faunal, and other dietary remains will be particularly informative as we seek the ways in which Irish identity was expressed and how it was transformed over time through engagement with other cultural groups. Members of the Beaver Island and Árainn Mhór communities are able to keep current with project progress as well as comment on our analyses and interpretations through the project web site (blogs.nd.edu/irishstories). The data from the excavations is and will continue to be disseminated via .pdfs on the blog as well.

Oral histories. In conjunction with the field excavation, we will collect oral histories both on Beaver Island and in Ireland. Póirtéir (1995:221) remarked upon the importance of oral history and noted that “Even in those cases where selective memory, the transmission process or artistic license may have confused chronology or other details, we can still find insights into the attitudes, feelings, and psychology of the people which wouldn’t be available from other sources.”

Oral history is also one important dimension of collaboration with descent communities. Little (2007:29) observed that “the poor, disenfranchised, or illiterate tend not to appear in documentation. Or, when they do, the available information is distorted and incomplete.” The colonial history of Ireland and the discrimination the Irish often experienced in the United States resulted in these immigrants frequently being virtually invisible in written records, aside from generic governmental documents like census enumerations. Collection of oral histories, therefore, is an important means of enhancing our understanding of immigrant experiences as well as providing opportunities for Irish Americans to contribute to the telling of their own histories.

Oral history collection on both sides of the Atlantic is also important because Ireland and the United States are inextricably linked. Fagan (2002:135) asserted that “Irish migration and the substantial Irish diaspora in different parts of the globe meant that Irishness was in a very real sense a globalized identity.” O’Toole (2000:12) extended the argument stating that “US culture is itself in part an Irish invention [and] Irish culture is inconceivable without America.” Orser (2004:174) similarly observed that “the historical reality of the diaspora means the linking of two disparate communities, composed of those who were born in and still live in Ireland, and those who were born in and still live outside Ireland, but
who still self-identify in some fashion as Irish.” From our conversations with Irish and Irish-American informants, we have gained important “new understandings of local and family histories as well as the impact emigration had and continues to have on the Irish people” (Rotman et al. 2007:10). As Murray (2006:15) asserted for the Irlandés in Argentina, “Even if it is not valid to extrapolate the values represented …to the universe of Irish emigrants to Argentina and their families, it is possible to imagine them behaving within the extensive array of intercultural relations of the community in which they lived.” The same is undoubtedly true for the Irish-American families on Beaver Island.

Former President of Ireland Mary Robinson (1995:2) further emphasized that the past is “human and not historic.” Through oral histories, both in Ireland and on Beaver Island, we have connected to the very personal and intimate narratives of national and global phenomena. Individualized accounts have added detail and texture to history that is often understood in anonymous terms. Through local media outlets (Beaver Beacon, Northern Islander, and The Donegal Democrat), postings in prominent public places, and word of mouth, we have successfully identified many informants who have shared their family histories with us and still others will be able to contribute their stories via the project web site (http://irishstories.crc.nd.edu, which is still under construction and will be completed by the beginning of the project in June 2013). Additional oral histories are presently curated with the Beaver Island Historical Society, a portion of which will be uploaded to the database on the website during the project period.

The websites will initially be hosted and maintained by the Center for Research Computing (CRC) at the University of Notre Dame. Upon completion of the project, the website will be archived and transferred to the Notre Dame central data center server farm where it will be hosted and maintained for five additional years by the Office of Information Technologies staff, who are responsible for campus-wide web hosting and support. Every five years, continued interest in the project materials will be assessed and a determination made as to whether the site will be archived in long term storage in the University digital archives or maintained as a live website for additional five year intervals.

Archival resources. An abundance of archival resources are available for understanding Irish-American experiences and identity. Helen Collar conducted research on Beaver Island for many years and all of her research notes are curated at Central Michigan University (some of which are also available online). The Beaver Island Historical Society and the Beaver Island Community Library also have a spectrum of historical records related to human occupation on the island, including Native American, Irish, German, and other cultural groups. In addition, there are a variety of documents pertaining to the island’s Mormon history that are curated by the Church of Latter Day Saints in Nauvoo, Illinois as well as in Racine, Burlington, and Voree, Wisconsin. Land deeds and other public records are on file with Charlevoix County Municipal offices. Archival resources relevant to the project are similarly available in Ireland, including but not limited to the University College Dublin Folklore Collection, the National
Archives, the National Library, and the Quaker/Friends Library and Archives, with additional local resources at the Árainn Mhór Community Center. Research in these various archives both in Ireland and the US has already begun, the results of which has explicited land ownership, illumintated the socio-economic and cultural history of the islands, elucidated changes to the landscape through cartographic data, and otherwise revealed aspects of daily life for Irish and other island residents. Continued archival research will expand this knowledge base. Follow-up historical research will also occur in response to questions generated by the archaeological field work.

**Contributions of this research program**

**Contribution to scholarship.** This project promises to make a significant contribution to our understanding of identity, ethnogenesis, and social relations by examining changes in material culture, foodways, and uses of space as Irish families continued traditions from their homeland, incorporated new cultural norms and practices through interaction with non-Irish groups, and otherwise navigated the multifaceted and dynamic social landscapes in which they lived.

One of the most salient aspects of the literature on ethnogenesis has been its emphasis on delineating particular historical and social contexts in order to describe the ways in which New World identities have emerged through global interaction (i.e., Voss 2008). In understanding the materialization of the Irish immigrant community on Beaver Island, lessons from the archaeology of the African and Chinese diasporas and creolization have been useful in elucidating the social relations within and between these diasporic communities as well as references to homelands of the imagination (e.g., Blakey and Rankin-Hill 2004; Bograd and Singleton 1997; Singleton 1999).

Cross-cultural encounter is primary in the historical experience of colonialism; ethnogenesis exists at the intersection of negotiated identities and colonial forces and is defined by its social relations (Rotman and Hauser 2006). Implicit is the simultaneity of sameness and otherness. While different historical contingencies were at work for the displacement of Irish laborers and the enslavement of Africans, the histories of these peoples are two threads of the same colonial narrative. Central to the colonial condition of Ireland was the displacement of Catholics over a successive number of generations. This displacement did not strip individuals of culture, rather it acted as a crucible in which peoples with varied heritage – including belief systems, class backgrounds, and ways of doing things – became aggregated and placed in new social landscapes. Within these contexts, social relations and identities were repositioned. In the migration from Ireland to America, unique regional and cultural variations in the homeland were homogenized in the perceptions of these immigrants by the dominant communities into which they were absorbed. Ethnogenesis elucidates the ways in which New World identities from displaced populations are created, transformed, and maintained. The proposed research on Irish-America
Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States

then contributes to the interdisciplinary study of these important questions on ethnogenesis, displaced and diasporic peoples, and the materiality of identity and culture contact.

This project includes a micro-historical approach to successive generations of the Irish diaspora with particular focus on the documentary record, material culture, and social landscapes (Mullins and Paynter 2000). Domestic households are key loci of social reproduction and, consequently, significant locations for archaeological research (Ludlow Collective 2001:95). Notably, “the home was an important locale where institutional policies and practices interfaced with small-scale interpersonal relationships” (Voss 2008:209). For Irish immigrant families on Beaver Island, their home was the place wherein the larger social and cultural worlds were negotiated, strategically accepted or rejected (either in whole or in part), and a meaningful family life created.

As Irish identities and experiences on Beaver Island were transformed through cultural interaction with non-Irish groups so too were their material and social worlds. At present, relatively little is known about the ethnogenesis of Irish-American identity away from large urban centers, such as Boston and New York. In addition, no controlled archaeological excavations have been conducted on the historic period occupation of Beaver Island (with the notable exception of Rotman’s 2010-2012 excavations; Rotman et al. 2011, 2012, 2013). As such, this material study makes a significant contribution to the comparative literature on Irish-America and ethnogenesis as well as the regional literature in historical archaeology (Rotman n.d.; Rotman and Fuentes n.d.). In addition, the results of the archaeological excavations will shape the ways in which contemporary populations perceive their own “Irishness” by providing additional sources of historical knowledge.

**Contribution to student audiences.** This project serves as an important vehicle for interdisciplinary training for students, who actively participate in all aspects of the project (cultural study, field excavation, archival research, oral history collection, laboratory analyses, and public outreach). They also engage with the relevant scholarly literature, contribute to project websites, and produce other scholarly products (such as senior theses, conference papers/posters, and co-authored articles for publication) as part of their professional development. Our student partners are drawn primarily from the University of Notre Dame, University of Vermont, and Grand Valley State University, but the project will be broadly advertised and participation will be open to students from any institution.

The required reading for the cultural study covers aspects of Irish life, including céilí dancing, sean-nós storytelling, religion, political history, agricultural lifeways, and the like. The texts for the field excavation module explicates the history of the site and region under study, frame the theoretical position from which we conduct the project, and provide comparative examples in history and historical archaeology. Students are also assigned a series of readings on oral history and oral tradition specifically relevant to the Irish diaspora and the other cultural groups on the island. The literature for the laboratory
module explores analyses of different artifact classes and interpretation. We discuss these articles both formally and informally in the classroom, field, and laboratory. Students are also required to keep a daily journal in which they reflect on their activities and accompanying readings, engage with intellectual themes, and synthesize their experiences. The data they record in their journals throughout the cultural study, field excavation, and laboratory analyses is utilized in their individual projects as they think critically, holistically, and transnationally about Irish-American immigration, ethnogenesis, and identity.

Students are required to select a subset of the research program to investigate more deeply. For instance, students might seek to answer a particular question about gendered divisions of labor or consumer choices or the roles of children at a site. Students each develop and publish a web page that discusses their chosen research question, the data they used to answer it, and their preliminary research results (see blogs.nd.edu/irishstories for examples from the 2010-2011 field seasons). These individual projects are the culmination and synthesis of the cultural study, field excavation, and laboratory analyses and contribute to answering overall project research questions (e.g., Ahern 2012; Duke and Rotman 2011; Fernandez and Rotman 2011; Lake 2011; Thomas and Rotman 2011).

Furthermore, students are encouraged to continue with their research during the subsequent academic year. Past products of student work have included senior theses, papers and posters presented at conferences, museum displays developed for the local public library, and co-authored publications. These professional development activities give students real world experience in archaeological inquiry and help make them compelling candidates for graduate school, fellowships or post-baccalaureate employment.

**Contribution to general audiences in the humanities.** The historical and archaeological investigation of ethnogenesis and Irish-America enriches public understandings not only of a unique chapter in local history, but of the culturally-diverse roots of the American Republic. The site was open to visitors from the general public every day along with a formal open house that took place during the Beaver Island Historical Society’s annual “Museum Week.” In addition, five lectures were given at the Beaver Island Community Center during the three field seasons to date. These opportunities for observation and engagement will continue to be available during the excavations conducted under this proposed project. The public may also participate by contributing their family oral histories (both in person and through the website) as well as by providing input on the project web site.

The involvement of the local community creates invaluable educational opportunities. Often individuals from the public are only familiar with archaeology through Indiana Jones movies or cultural resource management work completed in conjunction with local development. In the former case, the public rarely understands the true scientific nature of archaeology, believing that the recovery of “things” is the only purpose of excavation, without understanding the importance of other data and their contexts. In the latter case, the public often has the misperception that archaeology only precipitates from and holds
up construction. In both scenarios, public education facilitates a dialogue about the importance of scientific recovery of archaeological materials and the significance of interpreting and preserving the past.

**History and duration of the project**

Since 2006, Rotman and her students have been investigating Irish immigrant experiences in the Midwest through archaeological excavation, archival research, and oral history collection. The first three years of this project focused on an Irish immigrant neighborhood in South Bend, Indiana, the residents of which worked in various capacities for the University of Notre Dame. Beginning in 2009, the project expanded to its current location on Beaver Island, Michigan.

The field excavations in South Bend investigated the Fogarty family and other Catholic immigrants in the Sorinsville neighborhood south of the University of Notre Dame’s campus, the results of which informs our study of Irish ethnogenesis and identity on Beaver Island. The Fogarty family’s status as Catholics gave them access to employment, education, and mortgages, among other material resources provided by the University. Consequently, their lives were profoundly shaped by their affiliation with the institution (Rotman 2010, 2011). The neighborhood’s location between the highly visible landmarks of the Golden Dome and the spires of St. Joseph Parish, however, demarcated their insular enclave, making them targets for anti-Catholic and anti-immigrant discrimination, creating a space in which Sorinsville residents were both incorporated into and alienated from the social worlds of the city.

The dishes from the Fogarty table that were recovered archaeologically embodied all of the complexities of their lived experiences – traditional practices from their homeland; negotiation of cultural norms of the city and creation of a meaningful home life; the need to solidify family or close family-like social bonds through meal sharing and tea time; a desire to emphasize similarities with neighbors rather than differences; and the unique life history of the family in the wake of their mother’s death (Rotman 2010, 2011, 2012). As such, their consumer choices were not reducible to simple binary assessments of poverty or wealth, familiar or unfamiliar practices, or alienation from or incorporation in the cultural world of South Bend. Rather their refined earthenwares illustrate the Fogarty family’s navigation of the ever-changing social world in which they lived. The Fogartys selectively embraced some aspects of local cultural norms, material resources, and social rituals while eschewing others in ways that reflected not only their household priorities but also their unique process of becoming Irish-American.

The South Bend project (2006-2009) was funded through the Department of Anthropology at the University of Notre Dame as part of the department’s annual field school in archaeology. Research results were disseminated via four conference papers, seven publications (four of which were peer-reviewed), and six technical reports (for both the archaeological excavations and the oral history collections in the US and Ireland) (e.g., Rotman 2007, 2008, 2010, 2012; Rotman et al. 2007, 2011; Shakour et al. 2010).
The pilot project at the Gallagher Homestead on Beaver Island was completed in 2010-2011 and also at the Boyle Farm Site in 2012. Funding was provided by a Learning Beyond the Classroom-Faculty LEAD Grant from the Institute for Scholarship in the Liberal Arts, College of Arts and Letters, and the Keough-Naughton Institute for Irish Studies, both of the University of Notre Dame. A private grant was also provided by Fr. Tim Scully and the Scully Family of Beaver Island, Michigan. The Keough-Naughton Institute and the Scully Family have pledged financial support for additional years of the project. All possible sources of matching funds have been explored and committed to this endeavor.

Preliminary research results to date have been published on the project websites, through four student theses, and presented via five public lectures at the Beaver Island Community Center. Analysis and interpretation of the data from the 2010-2012 excavations is on-going and two articles on the Beaver Island Irish are currently in preparation for American Anthropologist and the International Journal of Historical Archaeology.

Research Methods

All aspects of the research design, field excavation, laboratory analyses, and dissemination of research results will follow accepted standards of professional archaeological practice (see the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for Archaeological Documentation, Federal Register, Sept. 29, 1983; 48(190):44734-44737). All key personnel exceed professional qualifications for archaeologists (Federal Register 1983:44739). All aspects of the pilot project have been undertaken in close consultation with the Office of the State Archaeologist for Michigan and this collaboration will continue with the proposed project, including the Section 106 Review Process.

Results of remote sensing will be used to guide excavation unit placement for more detailed investigation of in situ cultural deposits. Discrete features such as trash pits, cellars, privies, and foundations from buildings will be targeted for investigation (as they are extant at each of the homelots in this study). These features will be especially productive in yielding ceramic and glass artifacts, botanical and faunal remains, and other data of particular interest to our research questions regarding Irish-American identity and ethnogenesis. Specifically, we are interested in if/how these material classes changed over time relative to the class, gender, and ethnicity of household occupants. We are also interested in material differences between first and second generation Irish immigrants; immigrants who spent some time in the US before coming to Beaver Island vs. those who emigrated directly from Co. Donegal; and how the material practices of Irish immigrants on Beaver Island compare to those of other Irish immigrant groups elsewhere in the US. Comparative research of interest to our study, includes Brighton’s (2011) archaeological excavations in Texas, Maryland; Killion’s (2010) study in Corktown, Detroit; and Orser’s (2007) investigation in the Five Points Neighborhood, New York City and elsewhere;
among others. These scholars also have productive professional relationships with the Principal Investigator (Rotman) and can be consulted in an advisory capacity throughout the project period.

The number of 1 x 1 m excavation units will vary according to site size, but are estimated to be 18-25 per site (approximately a 10% sample of the most actively utilized areas of the yard around each house). Units will be excavated in arbitrary 3 cm or natural levels, depending on the stratigraphy present (plow zone versus buried A-horizon). The excavation interval may be further decreased in order to maximize temporal control, particularly in middens where deposition may have occurred over a relatively short time interval. The excavation of test units will be terminated 10 cm into the culturally-sterile subsoil. All soil will be screened through ¼ inch mesh. For features measuring less than 1 m in diameter, one half will be screened and the remaining half will be collected for flotation. Larger features (>1 m in diameter) will be sampled in consultation with the Office of the State Archaeologist.

All artifacts will be collected, bagged, labeled with proper provenience, and taken to the lab at the end of each field day. Preliminary processing of all cultural materials will be completed while on Beaver Island. Additional processing and analyses will occur at the Reyniers Laboratory at the University of Notre Dame. Botanical remains will be analyzed by Dr. Bush at Macrobotanical Analysis, while faunal remains will be sent to Dr. Martin at the Illinois State Museum. Final curation of project materials, including all artifacts, copies of field notes, photographs, maps, and other documentation will be with the Beaver Island Historical Society.

The Protar House is listed on the National Register of Historic Places for its association with events important in history (Criterion C) and association with a historically significant person (Criterion B). No archaeological work has been completed there yet, however, so the archaeological deposits that might contribute to the site’s significance under Criterion D (likely to yield information important in prehistory or history) remain unexplored. The significance of the other homesteads has also not yet been evaluated. This study is designed to determine the nature, extent, and significance of archaeological deposits associated with the properties under investigation. The data recovered will be used to assess the eligibility of each site for inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion D.

Permission is secured to record all oral history interviews. The audio file and transcription are uploaded to the project web site (irishstories.crc.nd.edu). All oral history collection is undertaken using Dr. Rotman’s approved Human Subjects protocol (Institutional Review Board 12-05-354).

Research products and dissemination of research results

The dissemination of research results for scholarly audiences will occur through a variety of different venues. A state-required technical report for each season of field excavation is completed and placed on file with the Office of the State Archaeologist for the State of Michigan, the Beaver Island
Community Library, the Beaver Island Historical Society, and the Department of Anthropology at the University of Notre Dame. A link to a PDF of the archaeological data and interpretations will also be made available through the project websites. It is anticipated that a minimum of three conference presentations and three peer-reviewed journal articles will result from the proposed project. Conference venues may include the annual meetings of the Society for Historical Archaeology, Midwest Historical Archaeology, Midwest Archaeology Conference, Society for American Archaeology and/or the World Archaeological Congress. Publications will seek to disseminate our research results regionally, nationally, and internationally and, therefore, will be submitted to venues such as *Journal of Beaver Island History*, *Historical Archaeology*, *International Journal of Historical Archaeology*, *Current Anthropology*, and/or *American Anthropologist*.

Research results will also be disseminated to general and student audiences. The project websites are interactive tools that allow visitors to view our interpretations and post comments (http://blogs.nd.edu/irishstories), view the technical reports from the excavations, and share their own family stories and oral traditions (http://irishstories.crc.nd.edu). Several public education and outreach activities were central to the 2010-2012 pilot project, including site open houses and public lectures at the Beaver Island Community Center. These were well-received and well-attended and will be repeated in future field seasons. In addition, museum exhibit(s) will be designed for the Beaver Island Local History Museum utilizing data recovered from the excavations as part of the culminating activities of this project.

References Cited

Ahern, Catherine. “Women and Economy: Analyzing the Roles of Women in Irish-American Communities during the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries.” *Journal of Beaver Island History*, accepted, 2012.


Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States


Ethnogenesis of Irish-American Identity in the Midwestern United States


Rotman, Deborah L. and Emily Flores, with contributions by Kasia Ahern and Abby Statham. Irish Immigrant Experiences at the Boyle Farm Site (20CX204), Former Gaeltacht, Beaver Island, Charlevoix County, Michigan: Results of the 2012 Archaeological Field Season. University of Notre Dame Archaeological Research Publication 12-01. For submission to the Office of the State Archaeologist, Lansing, Michigan, in preparation, 2013.


