
IRISH IMMIGRANT EXPERIENCES AT THE DAN
AND CATHERINE BOYLE FARM SITE (20CX204),
BEAVER ISLAND, CHARLEVOIX COUNTY,
MICHIGAN: RESULTS OF THE 2012 EXCAVATIONS

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME ACCESSION #2012.01

Prepared for:

Dr. Dean Anderson
Office of the State Archaeologist
702 West Kalamazoo Street
Lansing MI 48915

Prepared by:

Deb Rotman, Ph.D., RPA, Principal Investigator
Ann Kroll Lerner, Ph.D.
Heather Van Wormer, Ph.D.
Emily Flores

with contributions by
Catherine Ahern
Adam Lake
Ariel Terpstra

Department of Anthropology
University of Notre Dame
622 Flanner Hall
Notre Dame IN 46556
(574) 631-7125
drotman@nd.edu

11 June 2013

PRELIMINARY DRAFT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	1
Acknowledgements	2
Chapter 1: PROJECT INTRODUCTION	3
Chapter 2: BRIEF HISTORY OF THE PROJECT AREA AND THEORETICAL FRAMING OF THIS RESEARCH ENDEAVOR	4
Material conditions on Beaver Island	4
Niche construction as a model of analysis	7
Niche construction on Beaver Island	7
Inheriting and constructing place	10
Research Questions of Interest	11
Brief History of the Dan and Catherine Boyle Site (20CX204)	13
Chapter 3: METHODS AND DATA	15
Ethical considerations for this project	16
Chapter 4: ARCHAEOLOGICAL EXCAVATION ON BEAVER ISLAND	21
Unit Summaries	23
Chapter 5: PUBLIC EDUCATION AND OUTREACH	55
Chapter 6: HISTORIC MATERIALS RECOVERED	56
Architecture Group	57
Arms and Munitions Group	59
Clothing Group	59
Communication and Education Group	61
Domestic Group	62
Faunal/Floral Group	75
Furnishings Group	75
Maintenance and Subsistence Group	76
Personal Group	77
Indeterminate	79
Prehistoric	79
Chapter 7: SPECIALTY ANALYSES AND PRELIMINARY INTERPRETATIONS	81
Chronology	81
Changes to the Landscape over Time	84
Glass Containers	85
Refined Earthenwares	86
Chapter 8: SENIOR THESIS PROJECTS	89
Essay 1: Women and Economy: Analyzing the Roles of Women in Irish-American Communities during the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries	89
<i>by Catherine (Kasia) Ahern</i>	
Essay 2: Irish-American Iconography: A Study of Symbolic Plasticity	99
<i>by Adam Lake</i>	
Essay 3: The Changing Face of Identity	107
<i>by Ariel Terpstra</i>	
References Cited	119
Appendix A: Artifact Inventory 2012	136

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1. (left) Locator map showing Árainn Mhór, Co. Donegal. Inspired by Connors (1999:56). (right) Location of Beaver Island off the mainland of Michigan. Image inspired by Connors (1999:57). Drawn by Elizabeth Maurath.	3
Figure 2.1. North end of Beaver Island where much of the historical development of the island has been focused, particularly the village of St. James (northeast corner around the harbor) and immediately south of the village (in the areas of clearance south and south of Font Lake). Image used courtesy of the <i>Beaver Beacon</i> .	5
Figure 2.2. Irish-built Greene Homestead on Beaver Island. Photograph courtesy of Mary Beth (Greene) Nelson.	9
Figure 2.3. Greene Homestead on Árainn Mhór. Photograph courtesy of Mary Beth (Greene) Nelson.	9
Figure 2.4. Location of the Dan and Catherine Boyle Site (20CX204). Beaver Island North Topographic Map. Drawn by Elizabeth Maurath.	13
Figure 2.5. The log cabin at the Boyle Site as a ruin ca. 1948, including a close-up (right). Photograph courtesy of Fr. Dan Connaghan.	14
Figure 4.1. Location of the Dan and Catherine Boyle Farm Site (20CX204) on Beaver Island. Image used courtesy of the <i>Beaver Beacon</i> .	22
Figure 4.2. Field conditions at the Dan and Catherine Boyle Farm Site (20CX204). Facing northwest. Photograph taken by the author.	22
Figure 4.3. Site map showing locations of excavation units. Each square = 1 m ² . North is to the top of the page. Drawn by Elizabeth Maurath.	23
Figure 4.4. Profile of the north wall of Unit 1.	26
Figure 4.5. Profile of the east wall of Unit 2.	30
Figure 4.6. Profile of the north wall of Unit 3.	32
Figure 4.7. Profile of the east wall of Unit 5.	38
Figure 4.8. Plan view of level 3, Unit 6.	39
Figure 4.9. Profile of the west wall of Unit 6.	41
Figure 4.10. Profile of the south wall of Unit 7.	43
Figure 4.11. Profile of the south wall of Unit 8.	46
Figure 4.12. Profile of the south wall of Unit 11.	53
Figure 6.1. Diamond-shaped escutcheon (left) and hinge (right) (Unit 5, Level 1).	57
Figure 6.2. Heavy-duty hinge (Unit 5, Level 2).	58
Figure 6.3. Handle of a gun (Unit 4, Level 3).	59
Figure 6.4. Heavy-duty self-shank button (as with blue jeans) (Unit 6, Level 3).	59
Figure 6.5. Metal buttons with fabric coverings (left) and milk glass sew-through button (right) (Unit 5, Level 5).	60
Figure 6.6. Milk glass sew-through button with accent brown rim (Unit 10, Level 12).	60
Figure 6.7. Metal suspender clasp fragments (Unit 2, Level 7).	60
Figure 6.8. Metal clothing or shoe buckle (Unit 4, Level 3).	61
Figure 6.9. Metal shoe sole (Unit 10, Level 5).	61
Figure 6.10. Stoneware inkwell fragments (Vessel S1).	61
Figure 6.11. Fragments of blue willow transfer-printed whiteware (Vessels W1 [bottom row] and W5 [top row]).	64
Figure 6.12. Undecorated ironstone plate fragments (Vessel I6).	66
Figure 6.13. Fragments of salt-glazed stoneware (Vessel S2).	68
Figure 6.14. Embossed rim sherd of a pearlware (?) plate (Unit 10, Level 9).	68

Figure 6.15. Base of a free-blown wine bottle (Unit 10, Level 9).	69
Figure 6.16. Side panel of a patent medicine bottle that reads “Gillet S...” (Unit 5, Level 5).	70
Figure 6.17. Teal glass body shards, possibly blown-in-mold or machine produced (Unit 2, Level 3).	71
Figure 6.18. Metal food container – crushed can (Unit 2, Level 4).	74
Figure 6.19. Decorative finial (Unit 8, Level 8).	75
Figure 6.20. A hexagonal and square nut (Unit 4, Level 3).	76
Figure 6.21. A bolt and square nuts (Unit 5, Level 2).	77
Figure 6.22. Metal file without handle (Unit 5, Level 1).	77
Figure 6.23. Metal mesh brooch with decorative butterfly (Unit 1, Level 3).	78
Figure 6.24. Plain pipe stem fragments, including a partial bowl (left) (Unit 6, Level 6).	78
Figure 6.25. A decorated pipe stem fragment (Unit 2, Level 6).	79
Figure 6.26. A prehistoric adze recovered from the historic midden, broken in two pieces (Unit 7, Level 3).	80
Figure 7.1. Histogram of window glass dates from the Boyle Farm Site (20CX204).	85
Figure 8.1. “The Usual Irish Way of Doing Things” from <i>Harper’s</i> (1871).	100
Figure 8.2. Engraving of the “Rioters in Kensington” from <i>A Full and Complete Account of the Late Awful Riots in Philadelphia</i> , John B. Perry, 1844.	101
Figure 8.3. The Emerald Isle ferry to Beaver Island.	106

LIST OF TABLES

Table 6.1. Historic Artifacts Recovered from the Boyle Farm Site (20CX204).	56
Table 7.1. Summary of dates for units and levels excavated at the Boyle Farm Site (20CX204).	82
Table 7.2. Summary of minimum glass vessels recovered from the Gallagher Site (20CX201), including their associations.	85
Table 7.3. Summary of minimum ceramic vessels recovered from the Boyle Farm Site (20CX204).	87